

ANNOTATED PATENT DIGEST

by Robert A. Matthews, Jr.

© 2005-07 Thomson-West, All Rights Reserved

CHAPTER 40 SUMMARY JUDGMENT

I. SUMMARY JUDGMENT STANDARDS

- § 40:1 Summary Judgments Under Rule 56
- § 40:2 Purpose of Disposition by Summary Judgment
- § 40:3 Summary Judgment is Proper in Patent Cases
- § 40:4 Definition of Material Fact

A. Movant's Burden to Support a Motion for Summary Judgment

- § 40:5 Show Absence of Disputed Material Facts
- § 40:6 Show Absence of Evidence of an Element Non-Movant Must Prove
- § 40:7 Facts Deemed Admitted by Non-Movant's Failure to Dispute

B. Non-Movant's Burdens to Oppose a Motion for Summary Judgment

- § 40:8 Showing the Existence of a Genuine Issue of Material Fact
- § 40:9 Conclusory Assertions or Arguments of Counsel are Insufficient
- § 40:10 No Opposing Evidence Needed when Movant Fails to Meet its Initial Burden

C. District Court's Obligations in Deciding a Motion for Summary Judgment

1. Treatment of Possible Factual Disputes

- § 40:11 Improper for Court to Resolve any Issue of Fact
- § 40:12 Scientific Issues are Fact Questions
- § 40:13 Fact Intensive Issues May Warrant Denial of Summary Judgment
- § 40:14 Evidentiary Standards Must be Applied
- § 40:15 May be Improper for Court to Grant Summary Judgment on a Basis it Raises *Sua Sponte*

2. Factual Inferences from Supporting Material

- § 40:16 All Inferences Must be Drawn in Favor of Non-Movant
- § 40:17 Drawing Inferences in Favor of Movant is Error
- § 40:18 Choosing Among Possible Inferences Amounts to Improper Fact Finding
- § 40:19 Drawing Inferences Does Not Extend to Presuming Facts Not Averred
- § 40:20 Credibility Determinations
- § 40:21 No Inferences for Issues of Claim Construction

D. Affidavits and Documents to Support or Oppose a Motion for Summary Judgment

- § 40:22 Use of Affidavits in General
- § 40:23 Affidavits Must be Based on Personal Knowledge
- § 40:24 Conclusory Affidavits or Expert's "Naked" Opinion Insufficient
- § 40:25 Affidavit Contradicting Prior Testimony or Response may be Ignored
- § 40:26 Attorney Argument
- § 40:27 Can't Presume Facts Not Set Forth in Affidavit
- § 40:28 Untimely Affidavits
- § 40:29 Failure to Object May Waive Right to Challenge
- § 40:30 Sufficiency of Affidavits Judged According to Regional Circuit Law
- § 40:31 Hearsay Statements in Affidavits and Documents
- § 40:32 Unauthenticated Documents

E. Need for Additional Discovery to Oppose a Summary Judgment Motion

- § 40:33 Sufficiency of the Opportunity for Discovery and Rule 56(f)
- § 40:34 Requirements of a Rule 56(f) Affidavit
- § 40:35 — Conclusory Statements and Speculation Insufficient for Rule 56(f)
- § 40:36 — Failed to File Affidavit
- § 40:37 — Affidavit Found Insufficient
- § 40:38 — Affidavit Found Sufficient
- § 40:39 Prior Diligence in Pursuing Discovery
- § 40:40 Discovery Sought Has Limited Relevance to the Summary Judgment Motion
- § 40:41 Questions of Law Ordinarily Should not Require Additional Discovery
- § 40:42 Discovery Sought is Privileged
- § 40:43 Regional Circuit Law Controls

§ 40:44 Reviewed for Abuse of Discretion

F. Waiver of Issues Not Raised in a Summary Judgment Proceeding

§ 40:45 No Waiver for Not Raising Separate or Unrelated Issues

§ 40:46 Waiver for Not Raising Related Issues

G. Other Aspects of Motions for Summary Judgment

§ 40:47 Filing a Motion to Amend to Defeat a Summary Judgment

§ 40:48 Cross-Motions for Summary Judgment

§ 40:49 Motions for Reconsideration

§ 40:50 Renewing a Previously Denied Motion for Summary Judgment

§ 40:51 Untimely Motions for Summary Judgment

**II. SUMMARY JUDGMENTS RELATING
TO PATENT INFRINGEMENT**

A. General

§ 40:52 Standards for Summary Judgment on the Issue of Infringement

§ 40:53 Characteristic of Accused Products

§ 40:54 Impact of Prior Art can Raise Fact Issues Precluding Summary Judgment

§ 40:55 Evidence Needed to Support or Oppose a Summary Judgment Motion
Regarding Infringement

B. Claim Constructions

1. Aspects of Claim Construction Impacting Summary Judgment Procedures

§ 40:56 Disputes of Claim Construction Do Not Create Fact Issue

§ 40:56.50 Ripeness of Summary Judgment Motion in view Claim Construction
Hearing

§ 40:57 Expert Affidavits – Dispute on Claim Meaning

§ 40:58 Undisputed Terms

2. Case Examples with Incorrect Claim Constructions

§ 40:59 Reversing or Vacating Summary Judgment Due to Errors in Claim
Construction

§ 40:60 Remand for Infringement Analysis

§ 40:61 Affirming Summary Judgment Despite Errors in Claim Construction

C. Literal Infringement

- § 40:62 Affirming Summary Judgment Finding Literal Infringement
- § 40:63 Reversing or Vacating Summary Judgment Finding Literal Infringement
- § 40:64 Affirming Summary Judgment of No Literal Infringement
- § 40:65 Reversing or Vacating Summary Judgment of No Literal Infringement

D. Literal Infringement with Means-Plus-Function Limitations

- § 40:66 Affirming Summary Judgment of Literal Infringement
- § 40:67 Reversing or Vacating Summary Judgment of No Literal Infringement
- § 40:68 Affirming Summary Judgment of No Literal Infringement
- § 40:69 Reversing or Vacating Summary Judgment of Literal Infringement

E. Doctrine of Equivalents

- § 40:70 General Standards for Summary Judgment Under the Doctrine of Equivalents

1. Summary Judgment of Noninfringement Affirmed or Granted

- § 40:71 Element Missing
- § 40:72 Improper Attempt to Read Out an Element
- § 40:73 Prosecution-History Estoppel
- § 40:74 Unmistakable Surrender of Alleged Equivalent Subject Matter
- § 40:75 Claim Language Specifically Excluded Alleged Equivalent Subject Matter
- § 40:76 Too Different (Fails Insubstantial Difference Test)
- § 40:77 Equivalent Disclosed But Not Claimed (Disclosure-Dedication Rule)
- § 40:78 Fails Function-Way-Result Test
- § 40:79 Scope of Equivalence Ensnarers Prior Art
- § 40:80 No Evidentiary Support of Infringement

2. Summary Judgment of Noninfringement Reversed, Vacated or Refused

- § 40:81 Erroneous Claim Construction
- § 40:82 Prosecution-History Estoppel Should Not Apply
- § 40:83 Fact Issues Regarding Prosecution-History Estoppel
- § 40:84 Fact Issues Regarding Rebutting the *Festo* Presumption
- § 40:85 Fact Issues Regarding Prior Art Limiting Scope of Equivalents
- § 40:86 Fact Issue as to Characteristic of Accused Product
- § 40:87 Fact Issue as to Degree or Substantiality of Differences

- § 40:88 Fact Issue as to Satisfying Function-Way-Result Test
- § 40:89 Erroneously Restrictive Equivalence Analysis
- § 40:90 Erroneous Hypothetical Claim Analysis
- § 40:91 All-Elements Rule Not Violated
- § 40:92 Miscellaneous Reasons for Finding No Infringement

3. Summary Judgments of Infringement

- § 40:93 Summary Judgment of Infringement Affirmed or Granted
- § 40:94 Summary Judgment of Infringement Reversed, Vacated or Refused

F. Design Patent Infringement

- § 40:95 Affirming a Summary Judgment of Infringement
- § 40:96 Reversing or Vacating a Summary Judgment of Infringement
- § 40:97 Affirming a Summary Judgment of Noninfringement
- § 40:97.50 Reversing or Vacating a Summary Judgment of Noninfringement

G. Willfulness of Infringement

- § 40:98 Affirming Summary Judgment as to Willfulness
- § 40:98.50 {Reserved} Reversing or Vacating Summary Judgment as to Willfulness

H. Corporate Officer's Personal Liability for Infringement Determined on Summary Judgment

- § 40:99 Case Examples Considering Corporate Officer's Liability on Summary Judgment

I. Alleged Act Not Within Scope of Infringing Conduct Under § 271

1. Infringing Acts of Under § 271(a)

- § 40:100 "Use" Under § 271(a)
- § 40:101 "Offers to Sell" Under § 271(a)

2. Inducing Infringement Under § 271(b)

- § 40:102 Affirming Summary Judgment of No Inducement Liability
- § 40:102.50 Reversing Summary Judgment Finding Inducement
- § 40:103 Affirming Summary Judgment Finding Induced Infringement
- § 40:104 Reversing Summary Judgment Finding No Inducing

3. Contributory Infringement Under § 271(c)

- § 40:105 Affirming Summary Judgment of No Contributory Infringement
- § 40:106 Reversing Summary Judgment Finding Contributory Infringement
- § 40:107 Affirming Summary Judgment Finding Contributory Infringement
- § 40:108 Reversing Summary Judgment Finding No Contributory Infringement

4. Exporting or Importing Accused Products

- § 40:109 Exporting Under § 271(f)
- § 40:110 Importing Under § 271(g)

III. SUMMARY JUDGMENTS RELATING TO PATENT INVALIDITY

A. In General

- § 40:111 Summary Judgment on the Issue of Invalidity May be Proper
- § 40:112 Challenger's Clear and Convincing Evidentiary Burden
- § 40:113 Patentee's Production Burden in View of the Presumption of Validity

B. Anticipation – § 102(a) or (b)

- § 40:114 General Standard for Summary Judgment Regarding Anticipation
- § 40:115 Affirming or Granting Summary Judgment of Anticipation
- § 40:116 Reversing, Vacating or Denying Summary Judgment that Claims were Not Anticipated
- § 40:117 Affirming or Granting Summary Judgment that Claims were Not Anticipated
- § 40:118 Reversing, Vacating or Denying Summary Judgment of Anticipation

C. On-Sale Bar - § 102(b)

- § 40:119 Affirming Summary Judgment of Invalidity for On-Sale Bar
- § 40:119.50 {Reserved} Denying, Vacating or Reversing Summary Judgment of No On-Sale Bar
- § 40:120 Affirming Summary Judgment of No On-Sale Bar
- § 40:121 Vacating or Reversing Summary Judgment of an On-Sale Bar

D. Public Use

- § 40:122 Affirming Summary Judgment Finding Claims Invalid for Public Use
- § 40:123 Vacating or Reversing Summary Judgment Finding No Invalidating Public Use

§ 40:123.50 {Reserved} Affirming Summary Judgment Finding No Invalidating Public Use

§ 40:124 Vacating or Reversing Summary Judgment Finding Invalidating Public Use

E. Anticipation by Prior Invention – § 102(g)

§ 40:125 Affirming Summary Judgment that Prior Invention Anticipated

§ 40:125.25 {Reserved} Reversing Summary Judgment that Prior Invention Did Not Anticipate

§ 40:125.50 {Reserved} Affirming Summary Judgment that Prior Invention Did Not Anticipate

§ 40:126 Reversing Summary Judgment that Prior Invention Anticipated

F. Obviousness – § 103(a)

§ 40:127 Affirming Summary Judgment that Claims were Obvious

§ 40:128 Reversing Summary Judgment that Claims were Not Obvious

§ 40:129 Affirming Summary Judgment that Claims were Not Obvious

§ 40:130 Reversing Summary Judgment that Claims were Obvious

G. § 112 Requirements

1. Written Description

§ 40:131 Affirming Summary Judgment of Inadequate Written Description

§ 40:132 Reversing Summary Judgment that Written Description was Adequate

§ 40:133 Affirming Summary Judgment that Written Description was Adequate

§ 40:134 Reversing Summary Judgment of Inadequate Written Description

2. Enablement

§ 40:135 Affirming Summary Judgment that Claims Lacked an Enabling Disclosure

§ 40:136 Reversing Summary Judgment that Claims had an Enabling Disclosure

§ 40:137 Affirming Summary Judgment that Claims had an Enabling Disclosure

§ 40:138 Reversing Summary Judgment that Claims Lacked an Enabling Disclosure

3. Best Mode

§ 40:139 Affirming Summary Judgment Best Mode Violated

§ 40:139.50 {Reserved} Reversing Summary Judgment that Best Mode Not Violated

§ 40:140 Affirming Summary Judgment that Best Mode Not Violated

§ 40:141 Reversing Summary Judgment that Best Mode was Violated

4. Claim Indefiniteness

- § 40:142 Indefiniteness Suitable for Summary Judgment
- § 40:143 Affirming Summary Judgment Finding Claims Not Indefinite
- § 40:144 Reversing Summary Judgment Finding Claims Indefinite
- § 40:144.25 Affirming Summary Judgment Finding Claims Indefinite
- § 40:144.50 {Reserved} Reversing Summary Judgment Finding Claims Not Indefinite

H. Double Patenting

- § 40:145 Summary Judgment Finding Invalid for Obviousness-type Double Patenting

I Inventorship Issues

1. Derivation – § 102(f)

- § 40:146 Affirming Summary Judgment of Derivation
- § 40:147 Affirming a Summary Judgment of No Derivation
- § 40:147.50 Reversing or Vacating a Summary Judgment of Derivation

2. Priority of Inventorship under § 102(g)

- § 40:148 Summary Judgments Relating to Establishing Priority of Invention

3. Correcting Omitted or Misjoinder Inventors

- § 40:149 Affirming Summary Judgment Refusing to Add Alleged Omitted Inventor
- § 40:150 Reversing or Vacating Summary Judgment Refusing to Add Alleged Omitted Inventor

4. Other Inventorship Issues

- § 40:151 Inventorship Claims to Antedate Prior Art

J. Reissue and Reexamination Related Summary Judgments

1. Improper Broadening of Claim in Reexamination or Reissue Proceeding

- § 40:152 Affirming Summary Judgment Finding Claims Broadened
- § 40:153 Affirming Summary Judgment Finding Claims Not Broadened

2. Violating Recapture Rule in Reissue

- § 40:154 Affirming Summary Judgment Finding Recapture
- § 40:155 Affirming Summary Judgment Finding No Recapture

§ 40:156 Reversing or Vacating Summary Judgment Finding Recapture

**IV. SUMMARY JUDGMENTS RELATING TO PATENT
UNENFORCEABILITY FOR INEQUITABLE CONDUCT**

§ 40:157 Factual Nature of Intent and Materiality Issues Generally Preclude
Summary Judgment

§ 40:158 Affirming Summary Judgment Finding Inequitable Conduct

§ 40:159 Affirming Summary Judgment Finding No Inequitable Conduct

§ 40:160 Vacating or Reversing Summary Judgment Finding Inequitable Conduct

**V. SUMMARY JUDGMENTS RELATING TO PATENT
UNENFORCEABILITY FOR PATENT MISUSE**

§ 40:161 Affirming Summary Judgment Finding Patent Misuse

§ 40:162 Affirming Summary Judgment Finding No Patent Misuse or that Misuse
was Purged

§ 40:163 Vacating or Reversing Summary Judgment Finding Patent Misuse or that
Misuse was Not Purged

**VI. SUMMARY JUDGMENTS RELATING TO DEFENSES
BASED ON FORFEITURE OF PATENT RIGHTS**

A. Laches

§ 40:164 Affirming Summary Judgment of Laches

§ 40:165 Reversing or Vacating Summary Judgment of Laches

§ 40:166 Affirming Summary Judgment of No Laches

§ 40:167 Reversing or Vacating Summary Judgment of No Laches

B. Equitable Estoppel

§ 40:168 Affirming Summary Judgment Finding Equitable Estoppel

§ 40:169 Reversing or Vacating Summary Judgment Finding Equitable Estoppel

§ 40:170 Affirming Summary Judgment Finding No Equitable Estoppel

C. License and Other Defenses

1. Repair/Reconstruction

§ 40:171 Affirming Summary Judgment Finding Noninfringing Repair

§ 40:172 Reversing Summary Judgment Finding Noninfringing Repair

§ 40:173 Reversing Summary Judgment Finding Infringing Reconstruction

2. License

§ 40:174 Implied License

§ 40:175 Express License

§ 40:176 Release Based on Settlement Agreement

**VI. SUMMARY JUDGMENTS RELATING TO
ISSUES ON INFRINGEMENT DAMAGES**

§ 40:177 Lost Profits

§ 40:178 Marking or Providing of Actual Notice

**VIII. SUMMARY JUDGMENTS RELATING TO UNFAIR
COMPETITION AND/OR BAD FAITH ENFORCEMENT CLAIMS
AGAINST PATENTEE**

§ 40:179 Affirming Summary Judgment of No Bad Faith Enforcement

§ 40:179.25 Reversing or Vacating Summary Judgment Finding Unfair Competition

§ 40:179.75 Reversing or Vacating Summary Judgment of No Bad Faith Enforcement

**IX. SUMMARY JUDGMENTS RELATING TO
EMPLOYEE/EMPLOYER ASSIGNMENT DISPUTES**

§ 40:180 Obligations to Assign Patent Rights

X. APPELLATE REVIEW OF SUMMARY JUDGMENTS

§ 40:181 Standard of Review

§ 40:182 Appealing a Partial Summary Judgment

§ 40:183 Appeals of the Denial of a Summary Judgment Motion

§ 40:184 Review when Factually Interrelated to Ruling on a Preliminary Injunction

§ 40:185 Supporting Summary Judgment on Alternative Grounds

§ 40:186 Appealing Claim Construction Does Not Necessarily Appeal Infringement Judgment

§ 40:187 Prevailing Party Seeks a Modification of Claim Construction Without Filing Cross-Appeal

§ 40:188 Appealing Judgment as to One Infringer But Not Others Does Not Raise Issue Preclusion